McLeod, T. Ian
Legal method

Contents

Preface to the sixth edition xv
Acknowledgments xvi
Table of cases xvii

Part I Ideas and institutions 1

1 An introduction to law and legal reasoning 3
  1.1 Introduction 3
  1.2 Legal method as a creative process 3
  1.3 The form of legal reasoning 7
  1.4 Propositions and processes: truth and validity 9
  1.5 Methods of reasoning: induction, deduction and analogy 10
    1.5.1 Introduction 10
    1.5.2 Inductive reasoning 10
    1.5.3 Deductive reasoning 11
    1.5.4 Reasoning by analogy 11
    1.5.5 The legal context 11
  1.6 Legal practice and legal scholarship 13
    1.6.1 Legal practice 13
    1.6.2 Legal scholarship 14
  1.7 Law and Justice 15
    1.7.1 Introduction 15
    1.7.2 Law and justice: some judicial perspectives 16
    1.7.3 The need for a real dispute 18
  1.8 The political element in judicial decision-making 20

2 The classifications of English law 23
  2.1 Introduction 23
  2.2 The possible meanings of common law 23
    2.2.1 Introduction 23
    2.2.2 Common law and statute law 23
    2.2.3 Common law and equity 24
    2.2.4 Common law and civil law 29
  2.3 The possible meanings of civil law 30
    2.3.1 Introduction 30
    2.3.2 Civil law and criminal law 31
  2.4 Public law and private law 32
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>Substantive law and procedural law</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.6</td>
<td>Classification by subject matter</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.7</td>
<td>The distinction between matters of fact and matters of law</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>The hierarchy of the courts as a diagram</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>Magistrates' courts</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.1</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.2</td>
<td>Magistrates' courts as courts of first instance</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.3</td>
<td>Magistrates' courts as appeal courts</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3.4</td>
<td>Judicial personnel in magistrates' courts</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>The Crown Court</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.1</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.2</td>
<td>The Crown Court as a court of first instance</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.3</td>
<td>The Crown Court as an appeal court</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4.4</td>
<td>Judicial personnel in the Crown Court</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>County Courts</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5.1</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5.2</td>
<td>County Courts as courts of first instance</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5.3</td>
<td>County Courts as appeal courts</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5.4</td>
<td>Judicial personnel in County Courts</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6</td>
<td>The High Court</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6.1</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6.2</td>
<td>The High Court as a court of first instance</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6.3</td>
<td>The High Court as an appeal court generally</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6.4</td>
<td>The High Court as an appeal court in criminal cases</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6.5</td>
<td>The High Court as an appeal court in civil cases</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6.6</td>
<td>The High Court as a supervisory court</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6.7</td>
<td>Judicial personnel in the High Court</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.7</td>
<td>The Court of Appeal</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.7.1</td>
<td>The Court of Appeal</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.7.2</td>
<td>Court of Appeal (Criminal Division)</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.7.3</td>
<td>Court of Appeal (Civil Division)</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.7.4</td>
<td>Judicial personnel in the Court of Appeal</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.8</td>
<td>The House of Lords</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.8.1</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.8.2</td>
<td>The House of Lords as a court of first instance</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.8.3</td>
<td>The House of Lords as an appeal court</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.8.4</td>
<td>Judicial personnel in the House of Lords</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.9</td>
<td>The Judicial Committee of the Privy Council</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.9.1</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.9.2</td>
<td>The jurisdiction of the Judicial Committee of the Privy Council</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.9.3</td>
<td>Judicial personnel of the Judicial Committee of the Privy Council</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.10</td>
<td>The new Supreme Court</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.11</td>
<td>Administrative tribunals and statutory inquiries</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.12</td>
<td>Rights of appeal and permission to appeal</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The constitutional context of legal method

4.1 Introduction 61
4.2 The rule of law 61
4.3 The legislative supremacy of Parliament 61
4.3.1 A statement of the doctrine 61
4.3.2 The origins and evolution of Parliament 63
4.3.3 The problem of the royal prerogative 64
4.3.4 The revolution and its outcome 65
4.3.5 The significance of the role of the courts after the revolution 67
4.3.6 A modern example of the legislative supremacy of Parliament 68
4.3.7 The nature and status of delegated legislation 68
4.4 The separation of powers 69
4.5 Balancing the constitutional doctrines 70

European Community law and English law

5.1 Introduction 73
5.2 The two European communities 73
5.3 The European Union and the European Community 74
5.4 The principal Community institutions 75
5.4.1 Introduction 75
5.4.2 The European Commission (arts 211-219 [ex 155-163] EC) 75
5.4.3 The Council of the European Union (art. 202 [ex 145]) 75
5.4.4 The European Parliament (arts 187-201 [ex 137-144] EC) 76
5.4.5 The Court of Justice of the European Communities (art. 22C-244 [ex 188-245] EC) 77
5.4.6 The Court of First Instance (art. 225 [ex 168a] EC) 78
5.4.7 The European Council 78
5.5 The Enforceability of European Community Law in the United Kingdom 79
5.5.1 Introduction 79
5.5.2 The status of treaties in English law 79
5.5.3 Direct applicability and direct effect of Community law 80
5.5.4 Direct applicability and direct effect of different types of Community legislation and the Francovich doctrine 82
5.6 Indirect effect of Community law 85
5.7 European Community law and national sovereignty 86
5.7.1 Introduction 86
5.7.2 The Community Law view of national sovereignty 86
5.7.3 The English view of sovereignty in the Community context 87

The protection of human rights and fundamental freedoms

6.1 Introduction 90
6.2 The English legal system and the protection of human rights before the Human Rights Act 1998 90
6.3 The European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms 93
### 6.3

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subsection</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6.3.1</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3.2</td>
<td>Interpretation</td>
<td>93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3.3</td>
<td>Precedent</td>
<td>94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3.4</td>
<td>Some Convention case-law and some English responses</td>
<td>95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3.5</td>
<td>Procedure</td>
<td>98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3.6</td>
<td>Remedies</td>
<td>98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3.7</td>
<td>The English presumption of compliance with international law</td>
<td>98</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### 6.4 The Human Rights Act 1998

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subsection</th>
<th>Title</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6.4.1</td>
<td>The aims of the Act</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4.2</td>
<td>How the Act achieves its aims</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4.3</td>
<td>Is the Act retrospective as to matters of fact?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4.4</td>
<td>The vertical and horizontal effect of the Act</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 7.1 Finding, citing and using the sources of law

#### 7.4 Law reports

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subsection</th>
<th>Title</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>7.4.1</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.4.2</td>
<td>The range of law reports</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.4.3</td>
<td>Neutral citation of cases</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.4.4</td>
<td>The citability of law reports in court</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.4.5</td>
<td>Editorial discretion in law reporting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.4.6</td>
<td>The problem of delay in law reporting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.4.7</td>
<td>Computer databases</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### 7.5 Statutes

#### 7.6 European Community law

#### 7.7 Reports of the European Court of Human Rights

#### 7.8 Miscellaneous sources

#### 7.9 Keeping up-to-date

### 8.1 An introduction to the doctrine of binding precedent

#### 8.2 Bindingness, flexibility and the rule of law

#### 8.3 A wide view of precedent

#### 8.4 A narrow view of precedent: the doctrine of *stare decisis*

#### 8.5 The distinction between binding precedent and *res judicata*

#### 8.6 Retrospectivity and prospectivity in the operation of binding precedent
8.7 Are the decisions of the courts actually the law or merely evidence of the law? 144

9 Ratio decidendi and obiter dictum 148
9.1 Introduction 148
9.2 The concept of ratio decidendi 148
9.2.1 Introduction 148
9.2.2 Goodhart's view 148
9.2.3 Descriptive and prescriptive ratios 150
9.2.4 Identifying the appropriate level of generality of the facts 151
9.2.5 The possibility of multiple ratios 153
9.2.6 Does every case have a ratio'? 155
9.3 Techniques used in handling ratios 155
9.3.1 Introduction 155
9.3.2 Following, approving and applying 156
9.3.3 Not following, doubting, disapproving and overruling 156
9.3.4 Distinguishing 156
9.3.5 The per incuriam doctrine 157
9.3.6 The changed circumstances doctrine 159
9.4 The concept of obiter dictum 160

10 Vertical and horizontal dimensions of precedent 163
10.1 Introduction 163
10.2 The vertical dimension of precedent 163
10.2.1 The House of Lords and the Court of Appeal 163
10.2.2 The Court of Appeal and Divisional Courts 167
10.2.3 Divisional Courts and the Crown Court 167
10.3 The horizontal dimension of precedent 168
10.4 Precedent in relation to the Judicial Committee of the Privy Council 168

11 Does the House of Lords bind itself? 172
11.1 Introduction 172
11.2 The historical perspective 172
11.3 The current position 173
11.3.1 The Practice Statement of 1966 173
11.3.2 The leading civil cases 176
11.3.3 The leading criminal cases 186
11.4 Is the use of the Practice Statement predictable? 189
11.5 Departure from previous decisions without relying on the Practice Statement 190

12 Does the Court of Appeal bind itself? 193
12.1 Introduction 193
12.2 The position in civil cases 193
12.3 The position in criminal cases 196
12.4 Should the Court of Appeal and the House of Lords apply the same principles?  
12.5 The relevance of the leapfrog procedure

13 Does the High Court bind itself?  
13.1 Introduction  
13.2 The first instance jurisdiction  
13.3 The appellate jurisdiction  
13.4 The supervisory jurisdiction

14 Arguments for and against judicial law-making  
14.1 Introduction  
14.2 Perceived strengths of judicial law-making  
14.2.1 Speed  
14.2.2 Judicial decisions deal with real situations  
14.2.3 Precedent operates outside the party-political arena  
14.3 Perceived weaknesses of judicial law-making  
14.3.1 The process is haphazard  
14.3.2 Judges are ill-equipped for the work of law-making  
14.4 Constitutional constraints on judicial law-making  
14.4.1 Introduction  
14.4.2 The party-political context  
14.4.3 Public policy  
14.4.4 Moral issues  
14.4.5 The relevance of Parliamentary action and inaction  
14.5 Conclusion

15 Precedent and principle in the European Court of Justice  
15.1 Introduction  
15.2 Reading European Court of Justice reports  
15.3 Precedent in the European Court of Justice  
15.4 Principles of Community law  
15.4.1 Introduction  
15.4.2 Proportionality  
15.4.3 Legal certainty and legitimate expectation  
15.4.4 Equality  
15.4.5 Fundamental rights  
15.4.6 Procedural propriety  
15.5 Subsidiarity  
15.6 To what extent does the Court of Justice differ in practical terms from the English courts with regard to precedent?
16 An introduction to statute law and statutory interpretation

16.1 Introduction

16.2 Drafting, interpretation and communication

16.2.1 Introduction

16.2.2 Interpretation and construction

16.3 The classification of Acts of Parliament

16.4 Precedent in relation to decisions on statutory interpretation

17 Statutory drafting

17.1 Introduction

17.1.1 The origins of Parliament

17.1.2 The origins of the Office of the Parliamentary Counsel

17.2 The modern Office of the Parliamentary Counsel

17.2.1 Introduction

17.2.2 The functioning of the Office of the Parliamentary Counsel

17.3 The drafting process

17.4 Consolidation and statute law revision

17.5 Wing's Rules for the drafting of legislation

18 Plain meanings, mischiefs and purposes

18.1 Introduction

18.2 Simple literalism in practice

18.3 The mischief rule

18.3.1 The mischief rule itself

18.3.2 How the mischief rule is applied

18.4 The purposive approach to interpretation

18.4.1 Introduction

18.4.2 The power of purposivism

18.4.3 Identifying the purpose

18.5 The problem of statutory nonsense

18.6 Are there any 'rules' of interpretation?

19 The idea of legislative intention

19.1 Introduction

19.2 Different types of intention

19.2.1 Direct and indirect intentions

19.2.2 Particular and general intentions

19.3 The speaker's meaning theory

19.4 Particular intention: delegation to the drafters

19.5 General intention: delegation to the judges

19.5.1 Introduction
19.5.2 The idea of political integrity
19.5.3 Does the delegation mode give the judges too much power?
19.5.4 Conclusion

20 Modern statutory interpretation in practice
20.1 Introduction
20.2 The basic rule of interpretation
20.3 Ordinary and technical meanings
20.4 Analysing the context: matters of language
20.4.1 Dictionaries
20.4.2 The immediate textual context
20.4.3 Reading an Act as a whole
20.5 Analysing the context: matters of law
20.5.1 Introduction
20.5.2 The anatomy of a statute
20.5.3 Reference to extrinsic materials
20.6 Presumptions
20.6.1 Introduction
20.6.2 Presumption against injustice
20.6.3 Presumption against absurdity
20.6.4 Presumption against retrospectivity
20.6.5 Presumption of strict interpretation of penal provisions
20.6.6 Presumptions relating to ‘and’ and ‘or’
20.6.7 Presumptions relating to consolidating and codifying statutes
20.6.8 Presumption of compliance with international law
20.6.9 Presumption of compliance with Community law
20.6.10 Presumption against gaining advantage from wrongdoing
20.6.11 Presumption against binding the Crown
20.7 The Interpretative Obligation under s. 3, Human Rights Act 1998
20.8 Change of meaning with the passage of time
20.8.1 Introduction
20.8.2 The problem of social change
20.8.3 The problem of technological change
20.8.4 Conclusion

21 Legislative interpretation in the European Court of Justice
21.1 Introduction
21.2 Characteristics of Community law which are relevant to its interpretation
21.3 The teleological approach to interpretation
21.4 Literal meaning, clear meaning and legal meaning
21.5 Retrospectivity

Appendix 1 Law reports and journals (some useful references)